

COUNCIL

7 JULY 2015

REPORT OF MANAGEMENT AND MEMBERS' SUPPORT MANAGER

A.7 ANNUAL REVIEW OF THE SCHEME OF MEMBERS' ALLOWANCES BY THE INDEPENDENT REMUNERATION PANEL (IRP)

(Report prepared by Karen Neath)

PART 1 – KEY INFORMATION

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

To agree a Scheme of Members' Allowances for 2015/16.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- The Independent Remuneration Panel has undertaken a review to propose recommendations to the Council for the Scheme of Allowances to apply with effect from 1st May 2015. The IRP's report is attached at Appendix A to this report.
- The IRP's recommendations have been advertised in the local press in accordance with the Regulations.
- Council must now have regard to the recommendations of the IRP in determining a Scheme of Allowances for 2015/16. The Council may depart from the IRP recommendations provided it can demonstrate good reasons for doing so, having taken all relevant matters into account.
- Council last considered and agreed a Scheme of Allowances on 17th May 2011. Since then a system of indexation has taken place with Members' Basic and Special Responsibility Allowances being indexed to the Officers' pay award. This has resulted in an increase from 1st April 2013 of 1% and from 1st January 2015 of 2.2%.
- The latest review proposes the following changes:-
 - Revised allowances for the Chairmen of the following Committees: Audit, Licensing and Registration, Corporate Management Committee, Community, Leadership and Partnership, Service Development and Delivery, Education and Skills and Human Resources;
 - Revised rates for Leaders of Opposition Groups;
 - That dependent and childcare allowance is paid at the living wage.
- Otherwise it is proposed that Basic and Special Responsibility allowances remain as for 2011 with indexes applied and that travel and subsistence allowances continue as adopted by Council on 17 May 2011.
- Following discussion with Group Leaders options for amending the Scheme of Members' Allowances 2015/16 as recommended by the IRP are set out below with the financial implications set out in Appendix B.
- Once the Part 1 recommendation has been moved and agreed, Members will be able to debate the options before the Part 2 recommendations are moved.

RECOMMENDATION(S)

PART 1

- (a) That Council notes the outcome of the IRP review and considers the options set out in the report for the Scheme of Allowances for 2015/16.

PART 2

- (a) That Council agrees the preferred option as set out in the report.
- (b) That the IRP undertakes a further review in 2015/16 and makes recommendations to Annual Council in May 2016.
- (c) That the Appendix 2 to the Scheme of Members' Allowances in Part 7 of the Constitution be amended to reflect the agreed allowances and expenses.

PART 2 – IMPLICATIONS OF THE DECISION

DELIVERING PRIORITIES

The adoption of a published Scheme of Members' Allowances, having regard to the recommendations of an Independent Remuneration Panel, is consistent with the Council's core values of integrity and openness.

FINANCE, OTHER RESOURCES AND RISK

Finance and other resources

The financial implications of the options are set out in Appendix B. Any additional cost of the Scheme agreed would be managed within the revised budget process for 2015/16 and estimate for 2016/17.

Appendix B also shows the current cost being incurred given the existing appointments to SRA posts.

Risk

The crucial feature of the Panel is that it is composed of people unconnected with the local authority. This degree of independence is designed to secure that the Council is directly accountable to the electorate in respect of the payments made to the Members and that the risk of any lack of transparency is mitigated.

LEGAL

The Local Authorities (Members' Allowances) (England) Regulations 2003 set out the arrangements to be followed in relation to Members' allowances and expenses. The Regulations set out that regard must be had to the recommendations of an IRP before determining or amending the Scheme of Allowances. Consideration of this report and its appendix will enable the Council to meet those statutory requirements.

The Local Government Act 1972 (sections 3 and 5) allows the payment of an allowance to the Chairman and Vice Chairman.

OTHER IMPLICATIONS

Members Responsibility For Reporting Receipt of Allowances

Members are advised to declare the receipt of a members allowance if **any form** of benefit such as income support or housing benefit is being claimed. The rules on how members' allowances are treated may vary depending on the benefit claimed and advice should be sought from the relevant administrating body. For example the rules for those in receipt of Housing Benefit and Council Tax Support state that "basic members allowance, special responsibility allowance and conference attendance allowance are treated as earnings except for any expenses which have been wholly, exclusively and necessarily incurred in the performance of their duties". Members are therefore advised that in order to claim expenses in these circumstances receipts and records to justify the expenses incurred must be kept.

Wards Affected

All.

PART 3 – SUPPORTING INFORMATION

CURRENT POSITION

Following discussions with Group Leaders, the following options are put forward for Members to debate at the meeting before selecting a preferred option.

Option 1 - the Scheme of Members' Allowances recommended by the IRP, as set out in its report to the Council (Appendix A).

Option 2 - the Scheme of Members' Allowances recommended by the IRP, as set out in its report to the Council together with an allowance of £700 pa. for each Member of the Planning Committee to recognise the time commitment and workload of those meetings and an allowance of £3,800 for the Chair of the Standards Committee to recognise the work of the Chair on this Committee.

Option 3a – the Scheme of Members' Allowances recommended by the IRP together with a pro rata reduction in all Special Responsibility Allowances such that the total cost of allowances in 2015/16 does not exceed the budget.

Option 3b – the Scheme of Members' Allowances recommended by the IRP with additional allowances for Planning Committee Members and the Chair of the Standards Committee together with a pro rata reduction in all Special Responsibility Allowances such that the total cost of allowances in 2015/16 does not exceed the budget.

Option 3c – the Scheme of Members' Allowances recommended by the IRP with an additional allowance for Planning Committee Members together with a pro rata reduction in all Special Responsibility Allowances such that the total cost of allowances in 2015/16 does not exceed the budget.

It is the strong view of the IRP that the panel undertake a further review in 2016. However, Members do also have the option to index the allowances agreed for 2015 to an index stated by the Council for a period of up to four years.

BACKGROUND PAPERS FOR THE DECISION

There are no background papers.

APPENDICES

Appendix A – Report of the Independent Remuneration Panel

Appendix B – Financial Implications of the Options

Tendring
District Council



INDEPENDENT REMUNERATION PANEL

REPORT TO

TENDRING DISTRICT COUNCIL

May 2015

Recommendations on the Level of Members'

Allowances to Be Paid in the Municipal Year 2015/2016

1. INTRODUCTION

i. Legislation

The requirement for an Independent Remuneration Panel (IRP), how it operates, and regulations governing the payment of Members' Allowances are set out in the Local Authorities (Members' Allowances) (England) Regulations 2003.

Part 4 regulation 19(1) states that "*Before an authority.....makes or amends a scheme, the authority shall have regard to the recommendations made in relation to it by an independent remuneration panel*"

ii. Independent Remuneration Panel

At Council on 25th November the following were appointed to the Independent Remuneration Panel:-

- ▽ **Clarissa Gosling (Chair)** – Farmer's wife with extensive experience of serving as an Independent Member / Chair on many public sectors board and committees including Ipswich Borough Council Standards Committee, Suffolk Family Health Service Authority, NHS Independent Review Panels, Panel of Misconduct Hearing Eastern Region Police Authority and is a Board Member of Orwell Housing Association.
- ▽ **John Wolton** –Worked in the building industry from 1948 as an apprentice and from 1957 onwards in the Clacton area as a plumber and heating engineer. He formed his own company in 1962, and worked on Frinton Homelands estate and Great Clacton estates. He has served on a number of community groups in Tendring.
- ▽ **Reverend Doctor William Lock** – Career was in railway station management including auditing, finance and dealing with complaints. He is Treasurer and Trustee of the Albert Edwards Hall Committee. He was previously Chair of the local residents association and served on Guildford Town Council.

iii. Existing Scheme

At the meeting of Full Council on 17 May 2011 it was resolved that a system of indexation be introduced for the following three years whereby any increase in members' allowances be the same as the officers' pay award. Accordingly, the members' allowances agreed in May 2011 have been increased by 1% from April 2013 and by a further 2.2% from January 2015. Council also requested that a review be undertaken and a report presented to the Annual Council meeting 2015 in respect of members' allowances to commence from 1 May 2015.

iv. The Political Structure

The political structure of the Council and the roles of its members in place whilst the current review has been undertaken are:-

- **Full Council** consisting of 60 elected Members;
- At the time of preparing this report the Conservative Group provides the Administration with Labour, Tendring First, Independent, Holland Residents, Liberal Democrat and UKIP Members forming the opposition;

- **A Cabinet** of 7 Members including the Leader of the Council. It has responsibility for Community Leadership in Tendring and takes a lead on the preparation of policies and strategies and recommends and implements the budget;
- **Overview and Scrutiny** functions are provided by 4 committees (Community Leadership and Partnerships, Service Development and Delivery, Corporate Management, and Education and Skills), each comprising of 8 members, each committee having separate and defined responsibilities;
- **Audit Committee** comprising 5 members whose duties include provision of independent assurance on the adequacy of the risk management framework, independent scrutiny of the Council's financial and non-financial performance and overseeing the financial reporting process;
- **Standards Committee** that consists of 7 members whose role is to promote and maintain high standards of conduct by Members and Co-opted members of the authority. It operates a Town and Parish Council' Standards Sub Committee;
- **Planning Committee** comprising 11 members. This committee meets monthly to handle the significant volume of planning applications that officers cannot determine under delegated authority;
- **Regulatory Committee** had 14 members. It discharged a range of regulatory functions for which the Council is responsible, including health and safety enforcement, pollution control, statutory nuisance and licensing. At the Full Council meeting on 24th March 2015 it was agreed to delete this committee and transfer its responsibilities to the Licensing Committee (subsequently to be named the Licensing and Registration Committee) with effect from Annual Council;
- **Local Plan Committee** has 15 members and oversees the preparation of the Local Plan;
- **Licensing Committee** that undertakes the quasi-judicial determination of personal licensing matters including Hackney Carriage, Private Hire, Public Entertainment, Liquor and Gaming licences. At the Full Council meeting on 24th March 2015 it was agreed to transfer the responsibilities of the Regulatory Committee to the Licensing Committee (subsequently to be named the Licensing and Registration Committee) with effect from Annual Council. It has 15 members and operates 4 specific licensing sub-committees;
- **Human Resources Committee** that deals with general staffing matters. It has 14 members.
- **Council Tax Committee** has 5 members and meets once a year to agree the overall council tax for the District.

v. **Elections 2015 and Further Review**

The Panel has conducted the latest review just prior to the Parliamentary, District and Town and Parish Council elections to be held on 7th May 2015. Despite their best endeavours it was not possible accurately to evaluate the relative burdens taken on by each committee chairman, so the previous balance has largely remained. The Panel is aware that the outcome of the elections could bring changes to the political make-up and Committee structure of the Council and therefore strongly recommend that a further review be undertaken in 2016. This longer period of time will enable any such changes to be taken into account, and the panel themselves to be more informed and able to gain an insight in the current operation of committees and the work involved for each.

vi. Evidence Gathering Longer Period of Time

The Panel was very impressed by the dedication and public spirit of the all councillors, and their enthusiasm for the work they did. They all seemed determined that public service should come above personal gain.

However, they were disappointed at the number of the councillors filling in the survey forms and, if a review is undertaken next year, they would be anxious to receive as many completed forms as possible, on a strictly anonymous basis.

The Panel has gathered the following evidence to support their decision making process:-

- Questionnaire sent to all Members;
- Interviews with Members and Officers;
- Information on the numbers of meetings, mandatory training etc. undertaken in 2014;
- Information on local wage rates and inflation;
- Comparative data from other Local Authorities in Essex;
- The current budgetary position for the District Council.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

Having considered the information available and, being mindful of the current financial position, the Panel make the following recommendations in respect of Members basic allowance, special responsibility allowances (SRAs) and expenses. Where the Panel are proposing no change in allowances, the allowance to be paid would be the 2011 amount agreed by Full Council together with the 1% and 2.2% increases in 2013 and 2015.

i. Chairman and Vice Chairman Allowances

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Chairman's allowance - £6,266

Vice Chairman's allowance - £2,209

ii. Basic Allowance

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Basic allowance - £5,122

iii. Leader of the Council SRA

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Leader of the Council - £18,438

iv. Cabinet Members SRA

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Cabinet Member - £10,832

v. Chairmen of Audit, Corporate Management, Community Leadership and Partnerships, Service Development and Delivery and Licensing and Registration

Committees SRAs

Having considered the length and number of meetings undertaken during 2014 and taking into account time for reading, research and training, the Panel recommends that the Chairmen of the Audit, Corporate Management, Community Leadership and Partnerships, Service Development and Delivery and Licensing and Registration Committees should be paid at the same rate. During the review, the Panel did receive conflicting information about the workload of the Licensing Committee. They would therefore like to do more research during the coming year on the role of all the Committees and Licensing and Registration in particular. In the meantime recommended amounts payable from 1 May 2015 are:-

Chairman of Audit Committee - £4,300

Chairman of Corporate Management Committee - £4,300

Chairmen of Community Leadership and Partnerships Committee - £4,300

Chairman of Service Development and Delivery Committee - £4,300

Chairman of Licensing and Registration Committee - £4,300

vi. Chairmen of Education and Skills and Human Resources Committees

Having considered the length and number of meetings undertaken during 2014 and taking into account time for reading, research and training, the Panel recommends that the Chairmen of the Education and Skills and Human Resources Committees should be paid at the same rate but one lower than the Chairmen of the Committees set out in v. above. The recommended amounts payable from 1 May 2015 are:-

Chairman of Education and Skills - £3,800

Chairman of Human Resources - £3,800

vii. Chairman of Planning Committee SRA

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Chairman of Planning Committee - £6,268

viii. Vice Chairman of Planning Committee SRA

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Vice Chairman of Planning Committee - £2,029

ix. Chairman of Licensing and Registration Sub Committees

No change proposed, giving a recommended amount payable from 1 May 2015 of:-

Chairman of Licensing and Registration Sub Committee A - £2,029

Chairman of Licensing and Registration Sub Committee B - £2,029

Chairman of Licensing and Registration Sub Committee C - £2,029

Chairman of Licensing and Registration Sub Committee General - £2,029

x. Opposition Group Leader(s)

Given the number of opposition groups now in place at the Council the Panel have carefully considered the rate of allowance payable to Opposition Group Leaders. The Panel have determined that it is appropriate to continue with the existing formula of separately recognising the role of being a spokesperson for their Group and that of co-

ordinating and managing the members in their Group. However, recognising the overall cost of being a multi group Council, the Panel is recommending the following amounts payable from 1 May 2015:-

Amount for being a Group Leader £1,000
For each Member of the Group £90

xi. Childcare Allowance

The Panel recommends **a rate of the living wage (currently £ 7.85 per hour) for a maximum of 15 hours per week.**

xii. Dependent Carer Allowance

The Panel recommends **a rate of the living wage (currently £ 7.85 per hour) for a maximum of 15 hours per week.**

xiii. Conference Allowance

The Panel **recommends that the existing rates should continue to be paid.**

xiv. Maximum Subsistence Allowances

The Panel **recommends that the existing rates should continue to be paid.**

xv. Mileage Allowance

The Panel **recommends continuation of the HMRC non-profit rates.**

3. REVIEW OF ALLOWANCES FOR 2016/2017

The Panel strongly recommends a further review of allowances be undertaken in respect of the municipal year 2016/2017.

SUMMARY OF PROPOSED ALLOWANCES 2015/16**Appendix A**

Allowances	£
Basic Allowance	5,122
Leader of the Council	18,438
Cabinet Member	10,832
Opposition Group Leaders	
– Amount for being a Group Leader	1,000
- Amount per additional Group Member	90
Chairman – Planning Committee	6,268
Vice Chairman – Planning Committee	2,029
Chairman – Licensing and Registration Committee	4,300
Chairmen – Licensing and Registration Sub Committees	2,029
Chairman - Audit Committee	4,300
Chairman - Community ,Leadership and Partnership Committee	4,300
Chairman - Service Development and Delivery Committee	4,300
Chairman – Corporate Management Committee	4,300
Chairman – Education and Skills Committee	3,800
Chairman - Human Resources Committee	3,800
Chairman of the Council	6,266
Vice Chairman of the Council	2,209
Expenses	
Childcare allowance	Living Wage (currently £7.85) per hour
Dependent Carer allowance	Living Wage (currently £7.85) per hour
Conferences – outside London	£120 maximum per day
Conferences – within London	£140 maximum per day
Use of a motor car – first 10,000 miles	HMRC rate (currently 0.45p per mile)
Use of a motor car – over 10,000 miles	HMRC rate (currently 0.25p per mile)
Use of a motor cycle	HMRC rate (currently 0.24p per mile)
Use of a bicycle	HMRC rate (currently 0.20p per mile)
Subsistence – breakfast	£6.00
Subsistence – lunch	£7.50
Subsistence - dinner	£12.00

Member's Allowance: Comparison with Essex Authorities

Allowance	Basilidon	Braintree	Brentwood	Castle Point	Chelmsford	Colchester	Epping Forest	Harlow	Maldon	Rochford	Tendring	Uttlesford
	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£
Basic Allowance	5,751	4,536	6,010	3,195	5,544	6,412	3,435	4,270	4,590	4,250	5,122	5,000
Special Responsibility Allowances												
Chairman of Council	-	4,536	-	-	-	-	-	2,500	4,590	8,500	6,266	4,000
Leader of Council	17,253	13,608	19,227	12,780	21,738	19,235	7,875	7,200	11,476	21,250	18,438	10,750
Deputy Leader of Council	11,502	11,340	12,391	6,390	14,346	12,118	-	4,900	4,590	12,750	-	6,500
Member of Cabinet	10,064	9,072	-	6,390	10,869	11,541	6,300	-	-	8,500	10,832	6,000
Chairman Overview and Scrutiny Committee	4,313	4,536	3,546	1,598	5,433	6,732	3,150	1,500	3,443	3,125	4,300 or 3,800	3,500
Chairman Governance / Audit Committee	-	4,536	-	1,598	1,086	3,847	2,150	1,500	4,590	-	4,300	-
Chairman Planning Committee	-	4,536	3,546	3,195	7,170	6,732	2,362	1,500	4,590	2,125	6,268	3,750
Chairman Licensing Committee	8,627	4,536	3,546	1,598	2,718	5,771	2,362	1,500	4,590	2,125	4,300	3,750

Leader of Main Opp. Group	7,189	4,536	5,319	-	7,170	7,694	-	2,000	4,590	2,125	1,000 plus 90 per member	1,500
Leader of each of other groups	-	1,134	2,633	3,195	-	10% opp leader x no. in grp	-	-	-	-	1,000 plus 90 per member	-
Other												
Carers (per hour)	6.50	10.00	Included in basic allowance for ease of administration	-	11.48	7.00	6.31	10.35*	-	15.00	Living Wage (£7.85)	15.00
Travel-car (pence per mile ppm)	0.45	0.45		0.52	0.45	0.45	0.45	0.40	0.45	0.40	0.45	0.45
Travel-car passenger (pence per mile ppm)	0.01	0.05		-	0.03	-	0.05	-	0.05	0.05	-	0.05
Travel-motorbike (pence per mile ppm)	0.24	0.24		-	0.17	0.25	0.24	0.29	0.24	0.24	0.24	0.24
Travel-bike (pence per mile ppm)	-	0.20		-	-	0.20	0.20	0.27	0.20	0.20	0.20	0.20
Broadband (monthly)	0.00	15.00		-	20.83	Included in basic allowance	Included in basic allowance	Included in basic allowance	18.33	-	Included in basic allowance	-
IT (annually)	450.00	-		-	125.00				-	iPad		-
Breakfast	6.88	6.68		Reasonable Expenses	6.45	4.77	3.00	-	7.00	6.72	6.00	Reasonable Expenses
Lunch	9.50	9.22			8.91	6.57	5.00	-	10.00	9.28	7.50	
Tea	3.76	3.64			3.52	2.59	0.00	-	-	3.67	-	
Evening Meal	11.77	11.42	11.03		8.13	8.27	-	15.00	11.49	12.00		

Allowance	Option 1			Option 2			Option 3a			Option 3b			Option 3c		
	Amount £	No.	Total £	Amount £	No.	Total £	Amount £	No.	Total £	Amount £	No.	Total £	Amount £	No.	Total £
Leader	18,438	1	18,438	18,438	1	18,438	15,947	1	15,947	15,091	1	15,091	15,402	1	15,402
Portfolio Holder	10,832	9	97,488	10,832	9	97,488	9,369	9	84,318	8,865	9	79,789	9,048	9	81,435
Group Leader (Labour)	1,360	1	1,360	1,360	1	1,360	1,176	1	1,176	1,113	1	1,113	1,136	1	1,136
Group Leader (Independents)	1,540	1	1,540	1,540	1	1,540	1,332	1	1,332	1,260	1	1,260	1,286	1	1,286
Group Leader (Holland Residents Association)	1,270	1	1,270	1,270	1	1,270	1,098	1	1,098	1,039	1	1,039	1,061	1	1,061
Group Leader (UKIP)	2,440	1	2,440	2,440	1	2,440	2,110	1	2,110	1,997	1	1,997	2,038	1	2,038
Group Leader (Coastal Independents)	1,450	1	1,450	1,450	1	1,450	1,254	1	1,254	1,187	1	1,187	1,211	1	1,211
Chair Planning	6,268	1	6,268	6,268	1	6,268	5,421	1	5,421	5,130	1	5,130	5,236	1	5,236
Vice Chair Planning	2,029	1	2,029	2,029	1	2,029	1,755	1	1,755	1,661	1	1,661	1,695	1	1,695
Planning Committee Members				700	9	6,300				573	9	5,156	585	9	5,263
Chair Licensing and Registration	4,300	1	4,300	4,300	1	4,300	3,719	1	3,719	3,519	1	3,519	3,592	1	3,592
Chair Audit	4,300	1	4,300	4,300	1	4,300	3,719	1	3,719	3,519	1	3,519	3,592	1	3,592
Chair Corporate Management	4,300	1	4,300	4,300	1	4,300	3,719	1	3,719	3,519	1	3,519	3,592	1	3,592
Chair Community Leadership and Partnerships	4,300	1	4,300	4,300	1	4,300	3,719	1	3,719	3,519	1	3,519	3,592	1	3,592
Service Development and Delivery	4,300	1	4,300	4,300	1	4,300	3,719	1	3,719	3,519	1	3,519	3,592	1	3,592
Chair Education and Skills	3,800	1	3,800	3,800	1	3,800	3,287	1	3,287	3,110	1	3,110	3,174	1	3,174
Chair Human Resources	3,800	1	3,800	3,800	1	3,800	3,287	1	3,287	3,110	1	3,110	3,174	1	3,174
Chair Standards				3,800	1	3,800				3,110	1	3,110			
Chair Licensing sub A	2,029	1	2,029	2,029	1	2,029	1,755	1	1,755	1,661	1	1,661	1,695	1	1,695
Chair Licensing sub B	2,029	1	2,029	2,029	1	2,029	1,755	1	1,755	1,661	1	1,661	1,695	1	1,695
Chair Licensing sub C	2,029	1	2,029	2,029	1	2,029	1,755	1	1,755	1,661	1	1,661	1,695	1	1,695
Chair Licensing sub General	2,029	1	2,029	2,029	1	2,029	1,755	1	1,755	1,661	1	1,661	1,695	1	1,695
Chairman	6,266	1	6,266	6,266	1	6,266	5,419	1	5,419	5,128	1	5,128	5,234	1	5,234
Vice Chairman	2,209	1	2,209	2,209	1	2,209	1,911	1	1,911	1,808	1	1,808	1,845	1	1,845
TOTAL			177,974			188,074			153,930			153,930			153,930
Basic	5,122	60	307,320	5,122	60	307,320	5,122	60	307,320	5,122	60	307,320	5,122	60	307,320
TOTAL			485,294			495,394			461,250			461,250			461,250
BUDGET			461,250			461,250			461,250			461,250			461,250
Difference			24,044			34,144			0			0			0
Actual to be Paid as Members are only entitled to one SRA															
Group Leader (Independents)			-1,540			-1,540			-1,332			-1,260			-1,286
Group Leader (Coastal Independents)			-1,450			-1,450			-1,254			-1,187			-1,211
Chair Licensing sub A			-2,029			-2,029			-1,755			-1,661			-1,695
Chair Licensing sub B			-2,029			-2,029			-1,755			-1,661			-1,695
Chair Licensing sub C			-2,029			-2,029			-1,755			-1,661			-1,695
			476,217			486,317			453,399			453,821			453,668
BUDGET			461,250			461,250			461,250			461,250			461,250
Difference			14,967			25,067			-7,851			-7,429			-7,582